13 Code Reuse: Inheritance and Delegation

In this lecture, we revisit points and colored points, and see the extent to which we can reuse code in the implementations of those ADTs. Until now, most of our reuse has been client-centric. But there are lots of opportunities for code reuse on the implementation side. Unfortunately, reuse is more subtle and problems-prone on the implementation side.

Before we start, recall our Point ADT:

CREATORS
  cartesian : (Double,Double) -> Point
  polar : (Double,Double) -> Point

OPERATIONS
  xCoord : () -> Double
  yCoord : () -> Double
  angleWithXAxis : () -> Double
  distanceFromOrigin : () -> Double
  distance : (Point) -> Double
  move : (Double,Double) -> Point
  add : (Point) -> Point
  rotate : (Double) -> Point
  isEqual : (Point) -> Boolean
  isOrigin : () -> Boolean

and our CPoint ADT:

CREATORS
  cartesian : (Double,Double,Color) -> CPoint
  polar : (Double,Double,Color) -> CPoint

OPERATIONS
  xCoord : () -> Double
  yCoord : () -> Double
  angleWithXAxis : () -> Double
  distanceFromOrigin : () -> Double
  distance : (CPoint) -> Double
13.1 Inheritance

Most object-oriented languages, including Scala, make a code reuse technique available to you: inheritance. Inheritance lets you reuse implementation code. (Contrast this with subclassing, which lets you reuse client code.) Inheritance is an implementation technique — a client generally couldn’t care less if you implement something via inheritance or not. Inheritance is related to subtyping, but it is a different notion. Unfortunately, most languages conflate the two, which tends to confuse matters somewhat.

Inheritance is powerful, and like any powerful tool, its power must be wielded wisely. At its core, inheritance is a very simple idea: when you create a subtype, instead of reimplementing every method in the subtype, you can just say that you will reuse methods that are already defined in the supertype. This is often called extending a class — and the source of the keyword extends that Scala and Java use to define subtypes. Inheritance basically lets us only write the “new” stuff when defining a subtype. Everything else comes from the definition of the supertype.

In my view, there are really two kinds of inheritance: innocuous, and less innocuous. Innocuous inheritance is completely unproblematic and a nice way to reuse code. Less innocuous inheritance is trickier and may introduce subtle bugs.

Innocuous inheritance is the idea that we have, say two class A and B that are subtypes of another class C. Both A and B have a method m implemented in exactly the same way — sometimes a helper function. The idea is that we can take that definition of m in A and B and hoist it up into C. Then inheritance says that m is now available in A and B (just like before), but it needs only be defined once. This is innocuous because m was defined to work with A and B in the first place (since that’s where they lived before the move up the subtyping hierarchy). We just changed the place where m was defined.

Less innocuous inheritance is the idea that we have a class A that is a subtype of B, and B has a method m that A wants to reuse, and therefore simply inherits it form B instead of redefining it. The reason why this is different than the situation described in the previous paragraph is that m is a method meant to work with B. That we are reusing it in A may make sense, or may not, or may work slightly differently, because A makes some changes to B, of which m is unaware. So we have to be more careful, and make sure that the behavior that we expect from m is in fact the one we get when we use m in A.
I will return to less innocuous inheritance in upcoming lectures, but for now, let’s use innocuous inheritance to get us some code reuse. Consider the implementation of the POINT ADT we obtain if we apply the usual Specification Design Pattern:

```scala
object Point {

  def cartesian(x: Double, y: Double): Point =
    new CartesianPoint(x, y)

  def polar(r: Double, theta: Double): Point =
    if (r < 0)
      throw new Error("r negative")
    else
      new PolarPoint(r, theta)

  private class CartesianPoint (xpos: Double, ypos: Double) extends Point {

    def xCoord (): Double =
      xpos

    def yCoord (): Double =
      ypos

    def distanceFromOrigin (): Double =
      math.sqrt(xpos*xpos+ypos*ypos)

    def angleWithXAxis (): Double =
      math.atan2(ypos, xpos)

    def distance (q: Point): Double =
      math.sqrt(math.pow(xpos - q.xCoord(), 2) +
                math.pow(ypos - q.yCoord(), 2))

    def move (dx: Double, dy: Double): Point =
      Point.cartesian(xpos+dx, ypos+dy)

    def add (q: Point): Point =
      move(q.xCoord(), q.yCoord())

    def rotate (t: Double): Point =
      new CartesianPoint(xpos*math.cos(t)-ypos*math.sin(t),
                        xpos*math.sin(t)+ypos*math.cos(t))

```
def isEqual (q:Point):Boolean =
(xpos == q.xCoord()) && (ypos == q.yCoord())

def isOrigin ():Boolean =
(xpos == 0) && (ypos == 0)

// CANONICAL METHODS

override def toString ():String =
"cartesian(" + xpos + "," + ypos + ")"

override def equals (other : Any):Boolean =
other match {
  case that : Point => this.isEqual(that)
  case _ => false
}

override def hashCode ():Int =
41 * (41 + xpos.hashCode()) + ypos.hashCode()

private class PolarPoint (r:Double, theta:Double) extends Point {

def xCoord ():Double = r * math.cos(theta)
def yCoord ():Double = r * math.sin(theta)
def angleWithXAxis ():Double = theta
def distanceFromOrigin ():Double = r
def distance (q:Point):Double =
math.sqrt(math.pow(xCoord() - q.xCoord(),2) + 
  math.pow(yCoord() - q.yCoord(),2))
def move (dx:Double,dy:Double):Point =
  Point.cartesian(xCoord()+dx, yCoord()+dy)
def add (q:Point):Point =
    move(q.xCoord(), q.yCoord())

def rotate (angle:Double):Point =
    new PolarPoint(r, theta+angle)

private def normalize (angle:Double):Double =
    if (angle >= 2*math.Pi)
        normalize(angle-2*math.Pi)
    else if (angle < 0)
        normalize(angle+2*math.Pi)
    else
        angle

def isEqual (q:Point):Boolean = {
    (r == q.distanceFromOrigin()) &&
    (normalize(theta) == normalize(q.angleWithXAxis()))
}

def isOrigin ():Boolean = { r == 0 }

// CANONICAL METHODS

override def toString ():String =
    "polar(" + r + "," + theta + ")"

override def equals (other : Any):Boolean =
    other match {
        case that : Point => this.isEqual(that)
        case _ => false
    }

override def hashCode ():Int =
    41 *
    (41 + r.hashCode())
    + theta.hashCode()
abstract class Point {
  def xCoord ():Double
  def yCoord ():Double
  def angleWithXAxis ():Double
  def distanceFromOrigin ():Double
  def distance (q:Point):Double
  def move (dx:Double,dy:Double):Point
  def add (q:Point):Point
  def rotate (theta:Double):Point
  def isEqual (q:Point):Boolean
  def isOrigin ():Boolean
}

We see that there is a lot of redundant code in classes CartesianPoint and PolarPoint — specifically, methods distance(), move(), add(), and equals() are all essentially the same, modulo some uses of xpos and ypos in CartesianPoint instead of the equivalent xCoord() and yCoord().

We can hoist those common definitions into a common supertype. Now, Point would seem a reasonable candidate here, and indeed, we can lift the common methods into Point, and inheritance would make those available to its subtypes. But Point is abstract, and is accessible to the rest of the world, and any code we put in there will also be accessible to the rest of the world — for instance, other classes that are subtypes of Point, such as CPoint, will also inherit those definitions, which may not really make sense for them. To keep Point as abstract as possible, let me instead define a new abstract class Common sitting midway between CartesianPoint and PolarPoint, and Point. The sole purpose of Common is to serve as a repository of the common methods between CartesianPoint and PolarPoint, and since it will be a supertype of both, the common methods will be available to the subtypes by inheritance. Here’s one way to do it:

object Point {

  def cartesian(x:Double,y:Double):Point =
    new CartesianPoint(x,y)

  def polar(r:Double,theta:Double):Point =
    if (r<0)
      throw new Error("r negative")
    else
      new PolarPoint(r,theta)
}
private abstract class Common extends Point {

  def distance (q:Point):Double =
    math.sqrt(math.pow(xCoord() - q.xCoord(),2) +
              math.pow(yCoord() - q.yCoord(),2))

  def move (dx:Double,dy:Double):Point =
    Point.cartesian(xCoord()+dx, yCoord()+dy)

  def add (q:Point):Point =
    move(q.xCoord(), q.yCoord())

  override def equals (other : Any):Boolean =
    other match {
      case that : Point => this.isEqual(that)
      case _ => false
    }
}

private class CartesianPoint (xpos:Double, ypos:Double) extends Common {

  def xCoord ():Double =
    xpos

  def yCoord ():Double =
    ypos

  def distanceFromOrigin ():Double =
    math.sqrt(xpos*xpos+ypos*ypos)

  def angleWithXAxis ():Double =
    math.atan2(ypos,xpos)

  def rotate (t:Double):Point =
    new CartesianPoint(xpos*math.cos(t)-ypos*math.sin(t),
                       xpos*math.sin(t)+ypos*math.cos(t))

  def isEqual (q:Point):Boolean =
    (xpos == q.xCoord()) && (ypos == q.yCoord())
def isOrigin ():Boolean =
  (xpos == 0) && (ypos == 0)

// CANONICAL METHODS

override def toString ():String =
  "cartesian(" + xpos + "," + ypos + ")"

override def hashCode ():Int =
  41 * (41 + xpos.hashCode()) + ypos.hashCode()
}

private class PolarPoint (r:Double, theta:Double) extends Common {
  def xCoord ():Double = r * math.cos(theta)
  def yCoord ():Double = r * math.sin(theta)
  def angleWithXAxis ():Double = theta
  def distanceFromOrigin ():Double = r
  def rotate (angle:Double):Point =
    new PolarPoint(r, theta+angle)
  private def normalize (angle:Double):Double =
    if (angle >= 2*math.Pi)
      normalize(angle-2*math.Pi)
    else if (angle < 0)
      normalize(angle+2*math.Pi)
    else
      angle
  def isEqual (q:Point):Boolean = {
    (r == q.distanceFromOrigin()) &&
    (normalize(theta) == normalize(q.angleWithXAxis()))
  }
}
def isOrigin ():Boolean = { r == 0 }

// CANONICAL METHODS

override def toString ():String =
  "polar(" + r + "," + theta + ")"

override def hashCode ():Int =
  41 *
  (41 + r.hashCode())
  + theta.hashCode()
}

abstract class Point {
  def xCoord ():Double
  def yCoord ():Double
  def angleWithXAxis ():Double
  def distanceFromOrigin ():Double
  def distance (q:Point):Double
  def move (dx:Double,dy:Double):Point
  def add (q:Point):Point
  def rotate (theta:Double):Point
  def isEqual (q:Point):Boolean
  def isOrigin ():Boolean
}

This trick can be pulled off pretty much any time.

Before turning to less innocuous forms of inheritance, let’s take a detour towards another, simpler, form of code reuse in implementations, that happens to provide a nice path to understanding inheritance in general.

13.2 Delegation

Consider the implementation of ADT Point above — either one, the one with the Common class or the one without.

Now also consider the implementation of ADT CPoint, again via the Specification Design Pattern:
object CPoint {

    def cartesian(x:Double,y:Double,c:Color):CPoint =
        new CartesianCPoint(x,y,c)

    def polar(r:Double,theta:Double,c:Color):CPoint =
        if (r<0)
            throw new Error("r negative")
        else
            new PolarCPoint(r,theta,c)

private class CartesianCPoint (xpos:Double, ypos:Double, c:Color)
    extends CPoint {

    def xCoord ():Double =
        xpos

    def yCoord ():Double =
        ypos

    def distanceFromOrigin ():Double =
        math.sqrt(xpos*xpos+ypos*ypos)

    def angleWithXAxis ():Double =
        math.atan2(ypos,xpos)

    def distance (q:CPoint):Double =
        math.sqrt(math.pow(xpos - q.xCoord(),2) +
            math.pow(ypos - q.yCoord(),2))

    def move (dx:Double,dy:Double):CPoint =
        new CartesianCPoint(xpos+dx, ypos+dy,c)

    def add (q:CPoint):CPoint =
        new CartesianCPoint(xpos+q.xCoord(),ypos+q.yCoord(),q.color())

    def rotate (t:Double):CPoint =
        new CartesianCPoint(xpos*math.cos(t)-ypos*math.sin(t),
            ypos*math.sin(t)+ypos*math.cos(t),
            c)
def isEqual (q:CPoint):Boolean =
    (xpos == q.xCoord()) && (ypos == q.yCoord()) && (c==q.color())

def isOrigin ():Boolean =
    (xpos == 0) && (ypos == 0)

def color ():Color = c

def updateColor (nc:Color):CPoint =
    new CartesianCPoint(xpos,ypos,nc)

// BRIDGE METHODS

def distance (q:Point):Double =
    Point.cartesian(xpos,ypos).distance(q)

def add (q:Point):Point =
    Point.cartesian(xpos,ypos).add(q)

def isEqual (q:Point):Boolean = q match {
    case cq:CPoint => isEqual(cq)
    case _ => false
}

// CANONICAL METHODS

override def toString ():String =
    "cartesian(" + xpos + "," + ypos + ")"

override def equals (other : Any):Boolean =
    other match {
        case that : CPoint => this.isEqual(that)
        case _ => false
    }

override def hashCode ():Int =
    41 * ( 41 + xpos.hashCode() ) + ypos.hashCode()
private class PolarCPoint (r:Double, theta:Double, c:Color) extends CPoint {

    def xCoord ():Double = r * math.cos(theta)
    def yCoord ():Double = r * math.sin(theta)
    def angleWithXAxis ():Double = theta
    def distanceFromOrigin ():Double = r

    def distance (q:CPoint):Double =
        math.sqrt(math.pow(xCoord() - q.xCoord(),2) +
                  math.pow(yCoord() - q.yCoord(),2))

    def move (dx:Double,dy:Double):CPoint =
        new CartesianCPoint(xCoord()+dx, yCoord()+dy,c)

    def add (q:CPoint):CPoint =
        new CartesianCPoint(xCoord()+q.xCoord(),
                            yCoord()+q.yCoord(),
                            q.color())

    def rotate (angle:Double):CPoint =
        new PolarCPoint(r, theta+angle,c)

    private def normalize (angle:Double):Double =
        if (angle >= 2*math.Pi)
            normalize(angle-2*math.Pi)
        else if (angle < 0)
            normalize(angle+2*math.Pi)
        else
            angle

    def isEqual (q:CPoint):Boolean = {
        (r == q.distanceFromOrigin()) &&
        (normalize(theta) == normalize(q.angleWithXAxis())) &&
        c==q.color()
    }
}
def isOrigin ():Boolean = { r == 0 }

def color ():Color = c

def updateColor (nc:Color):CPoint =
    new PolarCPoint(r,theta,nc)

// BRIDGE METHODS

def distance (q:Point):Double =
    Point.polar(r,theta).distance(q)

def add (q:Point):Point =
    Point.polar(r,theta).add(q)

def isEqual (q:Point):Boolean = q match {
    case cq:CPoint => isEqual(cq)
    case _ => false
}

// CANONICAL METHODS

override def toString ():String =
    "polar(" + r + "," + theta + ")"

override def equals (other : Any):Boolean =
    other match {
        case that : Point => this.isEqual(that)
        case _ => false
    }

override def hashCode ():Int =
    41 * (41 + r.hashCode()) + theta.hashCode()
abstract class CPoint extends Point {
  def xCoord ():Double
  def yCoord ():Double
  def angleWithXAxis ():Double
  def distanceFromOrigin ():Double
  def distance (q:CPoint):Double
  def move (dx:Double,dy:Double):CPoint
  def add (q:CPoint):CPoint
  def rotate (theta:Double):CPoint
  def isEqual (q:CPoint):Boolean
  def isOrigin ():Boolean
  def color ():Color
  def updateColor (nc:Color):CPoint
}

As usual, because we want CPoint to be a subtype of Point, we need to implement bridge methods. I’ve done them in a different way here — have a look.

Clearly, we could pull the same trick as we did in Point and hoist some of the common definitions of methods from the implementation classes of CPoint into an abstract class. But we can do better. Notice that there is a lot of code redundancy between CPoints and Points. In fact, most of the methods for CPoints have been lifted from Point, and modified slightly in a few cases.

So can we implement CPoint in such a way that we can reuse the effort we’ve put into Point? The answer is yes, up to a point. The big problem right now is that Point is pretty well sealed off. That was the point of the course until now: hide implementation details as much as possible. But hiding implementation details makes it difficult to reuse implementation code.

Thankfully, in this case, we can reuse implementation code without actually knowing how that Points are implemented. The idea is to consider a colored point to be a point with a color attached. We know how to deal with points (we have a class Point to work with them), so most of the work can be done there. What we do now is that our implementation for CPoint, instead of being a couple of implementation classes, is just a class CPointImpl that wraps a color around a Point. Most methods simply delegate to the underlying Point, involving color only when needed. This approach is called delegation. Here’s the code:

object CPoint {
  def cartesian(x:Double,y:Double,c:Color):CPoint = {
    // create delegate
    val del:Point = Point.cartesian(x,y)
    new CPointImpl(del,c)
  }
}
def polar(r:Double,theta:Double,c:Color):CPoint = {
    // create delegate
    val del:Point = Point.polar(r,theta)
    new CPointImpl(del,c)
}

private class CPointImpl (del:Point, c:Color) extends CPoint {
    // easy delegations
    def xCoord ():Double = del.xCoord()
    def yCoord ():Double = del.yCoord()
    def distanceFromOrigin ():Double = del.distanceFromOrigin()
    def angleWithXAxis ():Double = del.angleWithXAxis()
    def distance (q:CPoint):Double = del.distance(q)
    def isOrigin ():Boolean = del.isOrigin()
    // delegations where we do something extra
    def isEqual (q:CPoint):Boolean =
        (del.isEqual(q) && c==q.color())
    // delegations where we need to "rebuild" a CPoint
    def move (dx:Double,dy:Double):CPoint =
        new CPointImpl(del.move(dx,dy),c)
    def add (q:CPoint):CPoint =
        new CPointImpl(del.add(q),q.color())
    def rotate (t:Double):CPoint =
        new CPointImpl(del.rotate(t),c)
    // methods specific to colored points
    def color ():Color = c
    def updateColor (nc:Color):CPoint =
        new CPointImpl(del,nc)
    // BRIDGE METHODS (some by delegation):
}
def distance (q:Point):Double = del.distance(q)

def add (q:Point):Point = del.add(q)

def isEqual (q:Point):Boolean = q match {
  case cq:CPoint => this.isEqual(cq)
  case _ => false
}

// CANONICAL METHODS

override def toString ():String =
  "cpoint("+del+","+c+")"

override def equals (other : Any):Boolean =
  other match {
    case that : CPoint => this.isEqual(that)
    case _ => false
  }

override def hashCode ():Int =
  41 * (41 + del.hashCode()) + c.hashCode()
}

abstract class CPoint extends Point {
  def xCoord ():Double
  def yCoord ():Double
  def angleWithXAxis ():Double
  def distanceFromOrigin ():Double
  def distance (q:CPoint):Double
  def move (dx:Double,dy:Double):CPoint
  def add (q:CPoint):CPoint
  def rotate (theta:Double):CPoint
  def isEqual (q:CPoint):Boolean
  def isOrigin ():Boolean
  def color ():Color
  def updateColor (nc:Color):CPoint
}
Note what is going on — we implement all methods in class CPointImpl, except that for many of these methods, we delegate to the underlying point that we constructed in the creators. We get to reuse code from the Point class, but without relying on inheritance, or in fact without even knowing how Point is implemented. As we shall see, we can think of delegation as an explicit form of inheritance. In fact, the most useful direction is the other way around: you should think of inheritance as an implicit form of delegation. Note the places were we need to wrap a color back onto a point after invoking a delegate method. Thos will become important next lecture.